

Report on Doctoral Thesis

Doctoral student:	Muhammad Shoaib
Title of Doctoral Thesis:	GHRM bundle practices predict sustainable performance in Pakistan's manufacturing firms: A Mediation Model of Green Human Capital
Reviewer:	prof. Ing. Aleksandr Ključnikov, Ph.D.
Place of Doctoral Examination:	Faculty of Management and Economics, Tomas Bata University in Zlín, the Czech Republic

Evaluation of the actuality of the topic of the Doctoral Thesis

It was truly a pleasure to review the presented Doctoral Thesis. This work stands out distinctly and ranks among the best doctoral theses I have had the privilege to evaluate. The topic of the Doctoral Thesis is highly relevant in today's globalized business environment. As organizations worldwide increasingly recognize the importance of sustainability, the study of Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) practices becomes essential. The focus on Pakistan's manufacturing sector offers a unique perspective, considering the rapid industrial growth in emerging economies. Drawing upon the Pareto principle, it's evident that developing countries can wield considerable influence, making the most significant green impacts with comparatively minimal effort from a global perspective. Furthermore, by introducing the mediation model of Green Human Capital, the research promises to provide insights into how human resources contribute to sustainable outcomes. Overall, the thesis tackles a contemporary issue with significant implications for both academia and industry.

As a result, the Doctoral Thesis topic can be considered timely and relevant.

Evaluation of the fulfillment of the objectives set out in the dissertation thesis.

The doctoral thesis exhibits a commendable depth, both in content and structure. The grounding of the content and the clear definition of the research gap provide a solid foundation for the study. Furthermore, the structure of arguments is well-organized and allows for logical progression. The formulation of the research problem and goal is both precise and rooted, ensuring clarity in the study's direction.

The thesis successfully establishes a clear linkage between its research questions and objectives, fostering coherence throughout the work. The definition of the research hypotheses is supported by an extensive literature review. The presentation of the results is systematic, with a focus on a comprehensive evaluation of the hypotheses in the discussion section. Additionally, the discussion of these results is well written, effectively linking back to the literature to situate the findings within a broader academic context.

In summary, the work has been carried out with diligence and a clear understanding of academic rigor. It's clear that the objectives set out in the Dissertation Thesis have been thoughtfully and successfully achieved.

Evaluation of the procedure of research objectives solvation, results of Doctoral Thesis, and the contribution of the student

The Doctoral Thesis adheres to a traditional research paper structure, including all essential components. The introductory segment precisely grounds the research gap and presents a commendably structured argument. The comprehensive literature review showcases 218 up-to-date scholarly contributions, ensuring the study is rooted in contemporary academic discourse. The linkage between the research questions and objectives is transparent and logically sequenced. The hypotheses are solidly grounded within the literature and confirm the research's credibility.

The methodological approach is clearly articulated. The research methodology is correct and appropriate. Figure 7 provides a detailed description of the research design.

In terms of data management, the data collection process is explained in detail, and the research sample size is both clearly justified and valid. The measures for the variables are well-defined, and their explanation ensures clarity. As presented in Table 4, the research constructs are effectively linked with the existing literature. It's also commendable that the research sample regarding the industry sector is diverse.

The results are presented in a structured manner, with a comprehensive evaluation of the hypotheses in the effectively articulated discussion section, tying the findings back to the literature research.

One minor observation is related to the demographic of the respondents. A significant part of the respondents belong to the group of less experienced ones (up to 10 years). Also, the research sample includes predominantly male (86%) respondents. However, this is contextualized considering the focus on the industry section.

In conclusion, the student's contribution in terms of the Doctoral thesis elaboration is evident. The author demonstrates the ability to conduct independent research and successfully accomplish all predetermined objectives. The findings bring forth novel insights, enriching the existing body of knowledge. Despite minor shortcomings, the overall evaluation is decidedly positive, marking a successful accomplishment of the thesis objectives.

Evaluation of the contribution to the development of the field of study and the practice

The doctoral thesis makes a significant scholarly contribution by advancing the academic discussion and broadening the existing literature on the significance of the contribution of Green Human Resource Management practices to the sustainable performance of industrial enterprises, specifically within the context of a developing country. Furthermore, it provides a valuable practical contribution by emphasizing the role of environmentally friendly practices in human resource management (HRM) for manufacturing firms, highlighting their potential to boost sustainable performance across environmental, economic, and social spectrums. The

research underscores the value of green hiring, training, performance management, and compensation, suggesting that these green HRM strategies, when properly integrated, can drive organizational advancement and offer manufacturing firms a competitive edge, both in Pakistan and potentially on a global scale.

Evaluation of formal and language issues of the Doctoral Thesis

The Doctoral Thesis meets all prescribed formal criteria for scientific work. The language employed is suitably academic. However, occasional formal errors in citation norms and the quality of several graphs, notably Figures 1 through 5 and 7, could be improved.

Evaluation of the publications of the doctoral candidate

The doctoral candidate presented a list of 9 articles published in peer-reviewed international scientific journals listed in the Web of Science (SSCI, ESCI) and/or Scopus databases and 8 conference papers. Most of the presented publications are related to the field of research. Remarkably, three of the author's papers were published in outstanding scientific journals (Technological Forecasting & Social Change, Journal of Cleaner Production, International Journal of Manpower). Therefore, the number and the quality of publications fulfill the conditions for proceeding to the defense.

Questions for the student for further discussion

1. Please comment on the data sample structure regarding the experience of the respondent and their gender characteristics and the potential limitations related to these characteristics.
2. Please comment on the procedure of data collection. How have you managed to achieve a response rate of 70%?

Definite statement of the reviewer of the fulfillment of the Doctoral Thesis evaluation

Based on a comprehensive assessment of the topic, the degree of achievement of goals, results, and benefits of work for the practice and the development of the scientific field, I recommend the Dissertation thesis for the defense. In case of a successful defense, I propose to grant the doctoral candidate the academic title of "Doctor" (abbreviated as "Ph.D.").

In Ostrava, 17.10.2023

prof. Ing. Aleksandr Ključnikov, Ph.D.